

One Patrick Balfour has been found through ySTR DNA testing to be a distantly related member of the ancient Scottish [DENNISON Patrilineage 1](#), and he has therefore been accepted as a member of the genealogical project organized on the basis of such testing. My analysis of his DNA will be found [here](#).

My aim herein is to analyze in some detail all the evidence I've encountered that may be relevant to Patrick's BALFOUR ancestry, and in particular to look into the chunks of Scottish spacetime where DENNISTON and BALFOUR converge in a way that may have led to the [NPE \(Non-Paternity Event\)](#) transition by which one of Patrick's early DENNISTON ancestors became a BALFOUR.

I have, in the first place, from Patrick, a pair of ancestral pedigree sheets that take his own claimed ancestry back some ten generations, mostly in Scotland. Patrick also sent me a massive chunk of material that I've christened [BALFOUR History \(BH\)](#)—this link is not to the piece itself ([here's my version of BH](#)), but to my bibliographic explanation of it, which I urge you to read, as it is both an important secondary source and highly problematic.

In trying to get a handle on these BALFOURs, I've also come across and made extensive use of a published genealogy called [The Balfours of Pilrig \(BOP\)](#), covering a BALFOUR branch that is more accurately styled the BALFOURs of Inchrye (BOI), and that pertains more particularly to Patrick's claimed lineage than most of the material in BH. Patrick appears to have picked up on a suggestion in BH of a linkage between the BOI and one of the more ancient BALFOUR lines of Fife, but I find this linkage dubious for reasons I'll cover below. In fact, Patrick has sent me virtually no evidence to support his BALFOUR ancestry, and I've tried to remedy that in at least some small degree by compiling abstracts from the Scottish Census of the families indicated on his pair of ancestral pedigree sheets; these [BALFOUR UKCensus abstracts are in Appendix C](#).

As [this BALFOUR surname distribution map](#) for Scotland shows, the principal concentration of BALFOURs as of the 1881 UKCensus was in Fife,^[1] spreading out from there into certain adjoining counties, and BH and many other secondary sources show that the Scottish landed gentry family of BALFOUR was established there by the 12th century, and held, at various times numerous estates and baronies, including those of Strath-Or, Burleigh, and Denmylne, among others.

I've distilled from *BOP* an indented tree covering the descendancy of [the BALFOURs of Inchrye/Pilrig](#) (hereinafter the BOI), which will be found in Appendix A, and I've culled from BH a similar indented tree (constituting Appendix B) for [the BALFOURs of Denmylne](#) who may be closely related to the BOI since their property in north central Fife was proximate to the estate of Inchrye.

The [Bibliography](#) at the end of this report provides details and commentary on my sources. My citations to these sources are generally enclosed in {curly braces} and include the relevant page#s where applicable.

Patrick's BALFOUR Ancestry over the last ten generations

Even though he has furnished me with no evidence, I've provisionally accepted Patrick's ancestry as shown on the two ancestral pedigree charts he has sent me, back through William the weaver of Glasgow, born 29Dec1734 (William1734). I've verified a fair stretch of that ancestry myself in the UKCensus for Scotland, and given the relative geographic stasis of his ancestral families until the late 19th century, the specific, and plausible, birth and marriage dates he has supplied back to William1734, I expect that there are parish records, or perhaps private family records that carry back before the first every name UKCensus of 1841.

However, I balk at accepting without specific evidence the next (and next to last) generation shown in Patrick's charts, the one that claims that William1734's father was John Balfour, wright, of Edinburgh, born Sep1684 (John1684)—not because there was no such person (this John is covered in *The Balfours of Pilrig (BOP)*), but because, unevidenced, this father-son connection is much less plausible than those for his more recent generations, given that Edinburgh, with its own center of gravity, is not Glasgow, because the

¹ Though Fife is a Scottish County, it's customary to refrain from referring to it as Fifeshire, as it was once a Kingdom.

professions of father and son are different, and because John would have been aged 50 when this putative son William was born. None of these are insuperable objections on their own, but collectively they need to be accounted for.

What is likely, nonetheless, is that Patrick's William1734 is descended in some way from these Edinburgh BALFOURs, because: first, the surname distribution map for BALFOURs based on the 1881 UK Census (even 150 years later) shows such a heavy concentration of BALFOURs in Fife, indicative of their area of origin, and apparently spreading out from there, that it's likely that Patrick is of this ilk; and second, because the Edinburgh BALFOURs of Pilrig, Edinburgh have been convincingly traced back to Inchrye their family estate in north-central Fife (which is why I prefer to call them the BALFOURs of Inchrye, or BOI), and once some small branch of a typical rural British family has sprung loose from its centuries old rural stomping grounds, it is that much more likely to evince a higher degree of mobility thereafter, and Edinburgh to Glasgow, or vice versa, was apparently a commonplace internal migration path for once urbanized Scots.

That said, [the BOI descendency I've culled from BOP](#), shows that there are any number of loose ends, male BALFOUR descendants besides John1684, whose lines are not followed in this book down to the present, from whom Patrick's William1734 may have been descended.

Patrick's Deeper Ancestry, likely in Edinburgh and Fife

Even though, at present, I regard Patrick's connection to the BOI as only likely, not established, the other thing we know about it, from the type of DNA testing that tracks a male's surname [patrilineage](#), is that Patrick is a DENNISTON as well as a BALFOUR; that is, that one of his remote patrilineal ancestors was born a DENNISTON, but somehow (due to an [NPE](#)) ended up with the surname BALFOUR. In fact, depending on just how and why this happened, that ancestor might still have been considered a BALFOUR by the other BALFOURs he probably had close ties with. We also know, by virtue of comparing Patrick's fully extended DNA haplotype with that of his tested DENNISTON cousins that he and at least one (and probably several) of them constitute a [closer cousin cluster](#) of the DENNISTON patrilineage that they all share. And since these DENNISTON cousins haven't yet been traced back to Scotland as Patrick has, figuring out where and when DENNISTONs and BALFOURs came together in Scottish spacetime, would not only shed light on the ancestral DENNISTON history, but also constrict and funnel the manifold possibilities for Patrick's BALFOUR ancestral lineage.

Possible Convergences between DENNISTON and BALFOUR in Scotland

Project member and expert Irish genealogist Barry Bradfield has usefully discovered two areas of possible BALFOUR to DENNISTON transitions in the Scottish records, and advanced reasonably plausible theories regarding the time and circumstances under which the NPE responsible for Patrick's BALFOUR surname may have occurred. Though neither of these theories is particularly specific or convincing in itself, the evidence that Barry has found, which places certain descendant lineages of these two ancient Scottish gentry families in proximity or association with each other, is at least highly suggestive and helps justify the classification of Patrick's yDNA haplotype as belonging to DENNISON Patrilineage 1.

In fact, Barry's two theories are vague enough that they are by no means mutually exclusive. Indeed, it seems likely that they both capture part of the truth—and part of the truth is all that we are ever likely to attain to regarding this NPE transition from DENNISTON to BALFOUR. My goal here is the modest one of trying to shed a bit more light and focus on the manifold possibilities these two areas of convergence open up, and since the first of these theories is based on geographic proximity in certain areas of Fife, there is need to take a closer look at the material in BH to try to see just where the BOI fit in.

The Background in Fife of Patrick's Putative Ancestors, the BALFOURs of Inchrye

Supposing that Patrick's ancestor William Balfour, the weaver of Glasgow (born there in 1734), can be connected to the BALFOURs of Inchrye (BOI), whether through John (b.1684 in Edinburgh) or otherwise, where does the BOI line lead?

As [the indented tree for the BOI](#) that I've derived from BH shows, the line begins with Alexander Balfour (1470-1518) who first acquired the family ancestral seat of Inchrye. Barry locates Inchrye on the southern coast of Fife, about 5 miles due south of Gaitmilk (Kinglassie). But this is unequivocally a mislocation (see [Maps of Fife](#), in the Bibliography).

The only references that googling "Inchrye Scotland" turns up are to a mansion house in the parish of Abdie, near the town of Lindores, in northern Fife, that was variously styled Inchrye House, Inchrye Lodge, and Inchrye Castle. Both evidence presented both in *BOP*, and some of the material in BH shows that Inchrye closely neighbored the lands of [the BALFOURs of Denmylne](#), and, not much farther away, the BALFOURs of Balgarvie, in Monimail Parish just to the east of Abdie.

Patrick, himself, in a brief prefatory comment to BH, claims that his ancestors descend from the BALFOURs of Burleigh. Where might he have gotten this idea?

Here's what the apparently well-researched *The Balfours of Pilrig* (1907) has to say about the BOI line on which it is almost exclusively focused (*BOP*, 11-12):

Descended from the Balfours of [Strathor and] Munquhanny were two leading branches of the family, Balfour of Burleigh, and Balfour of Balgarvy. The Balgarvies, at all events after 1500, were near neighbors of our ancestors and may have been the stock from which they came. The first ancestor for whom the Balfours of Pilrig can at present be traced, was one Alexander Balfour, who, as will be seen, held lands in Fife in the beginning of the sixteenth century and offices in the royal household. He was very possibly Alexander Balfour, younger of Torrie, who held lands in Cessintully in the barony of Doune [Stirling] in 1483. If so, he was of the Burleigh line. Between the years 1490 and 1512 there seem to have been a number of Balfours in the King's service, presumably connected with the above families. We find Alexander in the reign of James IV filling one of the positions in the household which it was the custom of the King to bestow on gentlemen whom he especially wished to reward. In 1499 and 1501 he is found in charge of the King's cellar, and Michael Balfour of Balgarvy in the same department [citing Exchequer Rolls, xi, 247].

In 1501 James IV gave the tack of Denmylne to John Balfour, son of James of Denmylne, probably on the death of his father; the Michael of Balgarvy who was in the King's cellar may have been a brother of his—perhaps, more likely, a cousin; and there is, of course, a probability that Alexander belonged to the same family. To him, the king gave, in 1502, the tack of Inchrye, [citing Exchequer Rolls xii, 621] a property lying near Denmylne, in the barony of Lindores. I quote concerning him a letter written by the Reverend Walter MacLeod, to whom was entrusted the task of making the researches into the more distant links of the family:

This royal servitor got the lands of Inchrye, and is the progenitor of the Balfours of Powhouse [Powis, Stirling]. It is suggestive that other Balfours, connections of the Balgarvy family, were about the same time tenants of the Crown in Perthshire, and that in the service of the kings, James III and James IV, there were this Alexander of Inchrye, John and Patrick of Denmylne, and Michael of Balgarvy, besides a James and a William not decidedly traced. These Balfours were probably all related, and as royal servitors were all about the same time getting advantageous tacks from the king of Crown lands. The fact that Alexander got Inchrye, and that Patrick and John got Denmylne in the same locality

might indicate a close relationship between these tenants, especially as Alexander is a name which occurs also in the Denmylne line, but hardly ever, if ever, in Burleigh....

Evidently, “the tack of” has about the same meaning as “the lease of” or perhaps “the use of” in English land law, and these royal feudal grants were merely for the life of the grantee, or even just at the monarch’s discretion, although the usual practice appears to have been to re-grant the estate to the original grantee’s legal heir on the former’s death. Thus, *BOP:17* goes on to say that King James V granted the tack of Inchrye in 1526 to David² Balfour, Alexander¹’s oldest son, though many conditions were attached, one of which was that the grain grown on the estate be ground in Denmylne—a clear indicator of the close proximity and association between Inchrye manor and the lands of the Denmylne BALFOURs. Just to follow up briefly on Inchrye, son David appears to have failed to fulfill the required conditions and abandoned Inchrye for the other grant he had obtained in Powis, in Stirling, and even managed to sell Inchrye later, contrary to the conditions of its tenure, and therefore illegally. Nonetheless, James² (Alexander¹) Balfour, later managed to buy the family estate back into the family—more on this below.

Although the above passage initially conjectures that Alexander, the first of the BOI, may have been of Burleigh, it goes on to say that the BALFOURs of Burleigh and of Balgarvy, both stemmed from the original baronial line of the BALFOURs of Strathor and Munquhanny, and concludes that Alexander was more likely a descendant in some way of the Balgarv or Denmylne BALFOURs, and not, therefore, of the geographically more remote Burleigh BALFOURs, as Patrick supposes.

At BH:6, and more fully at BH:11, I find a set of claims regarding the relationships between the BALFOURs of Burleigh, Balgarvy, and Strator-Munquhanny, and also a suggestion, which I think untenable, as to where Alexander of Inchrye may have fit in.

It is said that one Sir Laurence of Strathor and Munquhanny (who died young in battle in 1429) had a second son, Sir John Balfour, who was granted lands by James II (1437-1460) of “Easter and Wester Balgarvy formerly held by a branch of the Fife family of Balfour”.^[2] Sir John was also supposedly in 1445-1446 granted lands in Burleigh, Kinrossshire (the county on the western border of Fife). This Sir John’s eldest son, Michael (whom I’ll label Michael-A), is said to have been the progenitor of the BALFOURs of Burleigh through his son and heir, Sir Michael-1, the 1st BALFOUR Baronet of Burleigh. Meanwhile, Michael-A’s younger brother James (James-A) is said to have been the progenitor of the BALFOURs of Denmylne. So far as this goes, the *BOP* version of this story is in agreement with the BH version, which I find reassuring.

However, the BH version (p11, under B7 III, 2) then goes on to suggest the Alexander who was the progenitor of the BALFOURs of Inchrye^[3] may have been a *grandson* of Sir Michael-1 of Burleigh, thorough his son Michael-2, the 2nd Baronet of Burleigh. But the generations don’t quite work here. Michael-2’s eldest son David-3, says BH:11, came of age, and into his inheritance, in 1542 (after his father had died in 1530), and was thus born about 1521. But *BOP* tells us that Alexander of Inchrye, cellarer to King James II by 1499, was granted Inchrye in 1502, and himself died about 1515.

BOP, which is presumably still the most detailed treatment of the main BOI line, was unable to come to any conclusion about Alexander¹’s ancestry, noting merely that the name Alexander ran in the Denmylne branch, but not in the Burleigh branch. And [the Denmylne descendancy](#) I’ve culled from BH shows that the Alexander who was the 4th lord of Denmylne, married Marion, a daughter of Alexander¹ of Inchrye.

Most likely, Alexander of Inchrye descended from one of the cadet branches of the BALFOURs of Balgarvie or Denmylne, near neighbors to Inchrye, in Abdie Parish in north-central Fife. BH is quite sketchy

² Since no specifics are provided about this otherwise ghostly Balfour family, I see no reason to take this claim seriously.

³ This is one of only two occurrences of the name Inchrye in BH—the other notes a BALFOUR cousin marriage between Marion2 (Alexander1 of Inchrye) and Alexander (born say 1530) of Denmylne (BH:18).

on the Denmylne branch, and has even less to say about Balgarvie so there are probably plenty of loose ends for Alexander to attach to.

Whatever Alexander of Inchrye's origins, he probably *was* a descendant of the original Fife gentry line of BALFOURs, so I will summarize here what I found in BH, which is generally in accord with [this briefer article on the BALFOUR surname at ElectricScotland](#).

It is said that the first surnamed BALFOUR was Sir Michael Balfour, son of Octred, the great-grandson of Siward, who supposedly came to Scotland from English Northumberland about 1050. Siward's grandson (also named Siward) by his son Octred was supposedly granted, in about 1100, the valley of the Orr, a minor tributary of the River Leven, that runs west to east from Loch Leven in south central Fife to the Firth of Forth.

This original Balfour barony was called the Barony of Strath-or ("Strath" meaning valley), and it was founded in 1196 when Octred's son Sir Michael obtained a charter for his lands from William the Lion, but died before his father Octred, who divided Strathor between Michael's two sons: the upper part (nearest the Loch) to son Michael, the lower (in the direction of the sea) to son William. Apparently, Michael's portion was later augmented by the lands of Montquhanny (a.k.a. Mountwhanney, etc.), presumably in the same neighborhood.

Theory 1: a possible DENNISTON-> BALFOUR NPE in Fife

Barry Bradfield's article, "[Dennisons, Chapter3](#)":7-8, which discusses the 14th century Malcolm de Danzielstoun who was a younger son of the Sir John de Danzielstoun (the early form of DENNISTON) who held a fief in Dunbartonshire, presents evidence that there were, much later, in the 16th century, DENNISTONs in Fife, whose doings were recorded in the town records of Dysart (a coastal town in south-central Fife), more specifically:

- (1) indications that two successive Robert de Danzielstouns (the second titled Sir) were ministers in Dysart
- (2) this text dated 1569: "David Danielstoun, Burgess of Edinburgh had sold the lands of Gaitmilk"

Barry also quotes this from an unidentified source:

The Abbey of Dunfermline possessed large tracts of land in Dunfermelin-schyre and Kinghorn-schyre. It also possessed the whole of Gaitmilk-schyre or Kinglassin-schyre (Kinglassie Parish), Dolor-schyre (Dollar Parish), and Nethbren-schyre (New-burn Parish). Besides these church lands the same district contained the...

and here his quotation breaks off. It should be noted that a "schyre" in early Scotland wasn't the equivalent of a county: it was simply a large landed estate that either belonged to the Crown or that was held as a tenancy in chief by one of the major Scottish lords, who regularly granted all or portions of these lands to sub-tenants on lease. From time to time, the monarchy deprived these lords of their holdings for treason or other high crimes, or, on the other hand, created new baronetcies, hereditary estates and titles, that were awarded to favored subjects. The land was also, by the time of the Reformation (in the 16th century) into parishes of the established church, and these divisions have persisted, with some border modifications to the present day. [This map of the parishes of Fife](#) provides some idea of the location of the place name references being here considered, as do [the other maps I've included in the Bibliography](#).

The name "Gaitmilk" doesn't appear on the map of parishes, because it was supplanted by the name "Kinglassie", which is (and was) a town/village in the western corner of the parish, with its lands, sometimes formerly called Gaitmilk or Goatmilk, spreading out from there to the east. The name Kinglace actually goes back to the 9th century and long predates Gaitmilk. It will be seen that Dunfermline parish lies to the SW of

Kinglassie, but as the passage above shows, the Abbey of Dunfermline had extensive land holdings elsewhere including “the whole of Gaitmilk-schyre”.

The other piece of evidence that Barry cites in his “Chapter 3” is a reference to “*magister, Malcolmus de Gaitmilk*” in the 14th century Annals of the Abbey of Dunfermline. “Malcolmus” is, not surprisingly the medieval Latin form of Malcom, and the Latin meaning of “magister” was “teacher”. Barry notes, for example, that the title was used to denote a person with a university background who was licensed to teach what he had learned. It also needs to be understood that the few universities of the time were principally training schools for ministers and the clerical class that served as functionaries in both church and state, and this continued to be the case until well into the 19th century. Given the conservatism of these British institutions, it may well be relevant that the English Puritan churches that emerged from the Reformation had two ministerial positions, both requiring a university degree: the principal minister, who was the inspirational and spiritual leader of the flock, and the “teacher”, who was especially learned in the scriptures and their exegeses, and whose principal function was to act as the chief moral disciplinarian for the congregation. Thus, the Latin term *magister* had an alternate meaning, probably not confined to a church setting, of “magistrate”.

The fact that there was a 13th century magister by the name of Malcolms of Gaitmilk, and later, two 16th century ministers of Dysart surnamed de Danzielstoun, and finally (contemporaneously) a Danzielstoun of Edinburgh selling Gaitmilk lands, is certainly suggestive of the possibility that Malcolms was a DENNISTON, even though, as Barry notes, he was never referred to as such in the records. Barry seeks to buttress this highly circumstantial theory with the idea that perhaps the lords of Gaitmilk had the medieval right of advowson to appoint the ministers of Dysart.

All this is made relevant to the present inquiry in Barry’s supplemental piece, “[Denniston and Balfour](#)”. BH and other sources tell us that the first of many BALFOUR estates in Fife was located in the later parish of Markinch and surrounds. Thus, the possibility exists that if Malcolms, *magister*, of Gaitmilk (suggesting that he was a proprietor of lands in Gaitmilk) was born a DENNISTON, he may have ended up with the name of BALFOUR because in some way, perhaps by marriage, he came into some of these BALFOUR lands.

However, this latter proposition, inspired by the knowledge that DNA testing has given us that an early ancestor of Patrick Balfour was in fact a DENNISTON, is built on a whole foundation of IFs, with insufficient evidence to elevate it out of the realm of speculation. Nor does it help that the location map included in “Denniston and Balfour” shows Inchrye (the ancestral home of Patrick’s supposed line of BALFOURs) in the south central Fife, in same general vicinity as these Dysart and Gaitmilk DENNISTONS and Markinch BALFOURs, because the Inchrye granted to Alexander¹ Balfour in 1502, whose descendants ended up in Edinburgh, was actually on the opposite side of Fife, at least 15 miles to the north.

Even the proposition that Malcolms of Gaitmilk was a DENNISTON is suspect, and even more the more ambitious theory that this was Malcolms de Danzielstoun, the younger brother of Sir William de Danzielstoun of Colgrain, in Dunbartonshire, who died in 1393. Barry himself includes the evidence in Chapter 3 that one Malcolms Dalnieston [sic] was granted forfeited lands in Ayrshire, far away on the Scottish west coast, though not so far from Colgrain or Dunbartonshire.

It also seems highly unlikely to me that Malcolms of Gaitmilk, or any of his descendants if they were (also) proprietors of land in Gaitmilk- or Kinglassie-schyre, would have had any right of advowson over Dysart ministers. After all, as the parish map shows, Dysart was its own parish, and the whole of Gaitmilk was in fact held by the Abbey of Dunfermline: surely the Abbot would have possessed any rights of advowson. I think that most likely Malcolms, *magister*, was a local Gaitmilk functionary of the Abbey of Dunfermline, perhaps the manager of its lands there, and any portion of these lands that he held were probably as a sub-tenant of the Abbey. Of course, Malcolms’s descendants, if they persisted in that area, may have become the effective owners of some of the Gaitmilk lands, and the two items of evidence Barry has found point that way.

Finally, as [my recent re-analysis of Patrick's DNA](#) shows (since he extended his haplotype to the full 111 markers), any DENNISTON to BALFOUR transition most likely occurred no later than the 16th century. And while it's entirely possible that one of the later DENNISTONS of Fife (who transplanted to Edinburgh) were Patrick's DENNISTON ancestors, even though Patrick's Fife-based BALFOURs had no association with them in Fife, Barry's second theory, though it too falls just short of providing direct evidence for the [NPE](#) that occurred in Patrick's ancestry, is at least based on an actual DENNISTON-BALFOUR connection.

Theory 2: A possible DENNISTON->BALFOUR Conjunction in Edinburgh

This second of Barry Bradfield's theories concerns The Balfours of Pilrig, whose ancestral home was Inchrye in Fife, and whom I therefore prefer to refer to as the BALFOURS OF Inchrye (BOI), while referring to the eponymous book on this BALFOUR line as *BOP*.

In 1595, one Isobel KING, widow of Robert Dennistoun, burgher tailor of Edinburgh, remarried in Edinburgh (as his second wife) one James BALFOUR {*BOP:27*}, a Presbyterian minister who had grown up in his ancestral home of Inchrye in Fife. Isobel's second husband, James Balfour, had first ministered in Advie, Morayshire, then had been called to Edinburgh St.Giles and was living there at the time of his second marriage. James was the gggGrandfather of John of Edinburgh, the supposed father of Patrick Balfour's ancestor William the weaver of Glasgow.

In 1613 (some 18 years after her remarriage) when perhaps the youngest DENNISTON son that Isobel (King) (Dennistoun) Balfour may have had by her first husband, Robert Dennistoun, would have come of age, we find the same Isobel releasing a claim she had to certain rents due from two Dennistons, burgher goldsmiths of Edinburgh, who may have been those sons {*BOP:45*}.

Barry's version of the theory of DENNISTON->BALFOUR conjunction here is that one of Isobel's putative Denniston sons, not necessarily the two in the 1613 document, took the surname of her second (BALFOUR) husband, who, according to *BOP:26-27*, had two sons himself, James Balfour and Andrew Balfour, as well as a daughter, Nicholas (likely the oldest child) who married, in Jul1595, George Garden.

Andrew, James's youngest, is said to have been born in 1787 {*BOP:26*}, before his father settled in Edinburgh. Like his father, Andrew was a minister, who took his degree in 1607, and in 1613 secured the living of Kirknewtown in the western suburbs of Edinburgh. Andrew died young, in 1624, but not before fathering three sons himself, James, Andrew, and John, and executing a testament dative (a kind of will) in which he made bequests to three servants: John Balfour, Margaret Balfour, and Helen Gairner {*BOP:45-46*}.

Were these servants, perhaps, Andrew's step-brother and -sister(s), the children of Robert Dennistoun, burgher tailor of Edinburgh, deceased? Was this John Balfour (born, say 1590), and established near Edinburgh by 1624 in association with the BOI, Patrick Balfour's DENNISTON ancestor?

Inchrye, the family estate in Fife that James's father had sold out of the family, was bought back in 1596 by James and Isobel King, the year after their marriage, and though leased to James's eldest brother, David, in effect Inchrye was entailed on James's younger, ministerial son Andrew; the suggestion is that this was made possible by James's second wife's money {*BOP:17*}. This raises the question of whether Andrew himself might have been his father James's stepson, and a natural son of Isobel's first husband, Robert Dennistoun of Edinburgh. This seems possible if a bit far-fetched, but what steers me away from this idea is the fact that none of Andrew's three sons was named Robert for his putative father. The widely followed [Scottish onomastic child-naming pattern](#) calls for the first son to be named for his father's father, and Andrew's first son is, as expected, named James.

No further DENNISTON-BALFOUR connections are mentioned in Balfours of Pilrig, but the book primarily follows the specific lineage of the author, though it does at least attempt to identify all the children of each ancestral family, and provide a few comments about them. Given that there was at least one known BALFOUR-DENNISTON conjunction, in 1595 Edinburgh, and given that, as Barry has discovered, there

were DENNISTONs early in Fife, there may well have been other such associations both in Edinburgh and in Fife, and the actual [MRCA](#) of project members Russell Dennison and Patrick Balfour, may go back a generation or two before Robert Dennistoun, burges tailor of Edinburgh: my yDNA analysis of the current DENNISON Patrilineage 1 project data points to a MRCA for Patrick and Russell who was born between about 1525-1675, and this possible DENNISTON->BALFOUR crossover from between 1595-1615 or so, which may make Robert Dennistoun (born say 1560) himself the MRCA, may usurp the crossover possibilities from 1615-1675.

Connecting Patrick to the BALFOURs of Inchrye/Pilrig (BOI)

The John Balfour of Edinburgh (b.1684) whom Patrick thinks is the father of his ancestor, William the weaver of Glasgow (b.1734), is a BOI descendant of the founder of the line, Alexander of Inchrye (b.say 1468), and if Patrick could be convincingly connected to this John, or to one of the many other BOI patrilineal descendants (most of whose lines are not followed in *BOP*), that would certainly be encouraging for some version of Theory 2: that the DENNISTON->BALFOUR transition that occurred in Patrick's line arose from the second marriage of the Rev. James Balfour of Edinburgh, a third generation descendant of the BOI founder, Alexander of Inchrye, and an ancestor of John Balfour of Edinburgh (b.1684).

Nonetheless, it's important to note that the BOI descendancy presented in *BOP*, from which I've culled [the indented BOI tree in Appendix A](#), has many male BALFOUR loose ends, any one of which might turn out to have the DENNISTON association we seek. Obviously, it would help greatly if clues to the origin of Patrick's closer cousin, Russell Dennison's immigrant ancestor, John1 Denniston of Virginia, could be found to narrow down these associational possibilities. Conversely, being able to pin down Patrick's earlier BALFOUR ancestry more solidly and identifying any additional opportunities for a DENNISTON ->BALFOUR crossover, could be highly beneficial to the task of figuring out where John1 Denniston, the AugustaCoVA immigrant came from.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

(my principal sources)

- (1) [The Balfours of Pilrig](#), Barbara Balfour-Melville (Edinburgh: William Brown, 1907)—or *BOP*

I've downloaded and read through the first 150 pages or so that deal with the background of this branch of the BALFOUR family whose founding member, Alexander (say 1468—say 1515), in 1502 first acquired their ancestral home, Inchrye, in northern Fife, but whose descendants ended up in occupation of their family seat, Pilrig, in Edinburgh, though the heir for several generations maintained ties to Inchrye. A better name for this line in my opinion would be the Balfours of Inchrye (BOI).

- (2) [Balfour History](#) (my PDF version)—or **BH**

[The original of this publication](#) is an extensive online compendium of unknown provenance that I've formatted into a PDF with pagination and a hyperlinked table of contents for reference purposes. The original is full of editorial errors and formatting inconsistencies that I've little or nothing to remedy in my version of it. I wish I could credit whomever put this together, but when I say "of unknown provenance", I mean that I can't find a clue as to who is responsible for it, and even its web cover page, of the domain <http://www.denmylne.co.uk/> is devoid of any identifying information.

This piece is also almost completely lacking in evidential citations or other substantiation, and I suspect that it was largely cribbed from the work of others. Nonetheless, it covers a huge amount of ancient Scottish BALFOUR history and lore, and includes much quoted material, a few transcriptions of inscriptions, etc., (mostly without attribution), seems mostly plausible on the surface, so I've more or less taken it face value and treated it as a legitimate secondary source for want of anything better.

. A version of BH with a few prefatory comments was sent to me by incorporated into a huge email by DENNISON Patrilineage 1 Project member, Patrick Balfour, along with a couple of ancestral sheets (source (3), below) that take his line back just 10 generations, and purport to connect to the BOI descendency.

- (3) a pair of ancestral pedigree charts furnished by Patrick, covering the 8 generations back from his Balfour grandfather "Jack" (18Jan1888 Belfast NIRE—31May1952 Toronto, CAN) through William Balfour, weaver of Glasgow, Scotland (b.29Dec1734 -), and two generations before him. I've posted Patrick's ancestry only through William the weaver pending evidence that John Balfour of Edinburgh of the BOI was his father.

- (4) Sir Robert Sibbald (1641-1722), *Memoria Balfouriana*

A classic source on the early BALFOUR family that's often quoted, but as it appears to be in Latin.

- (5) John Bernard Burke, *A Genealogical and Heraldic History of the Landed Gentry of Great Britain* (1925), [3:133-136](#). This traces the Trenaby line back through the BALFOURs of Burleigh and Strathor.

- (6) two pieces published by Irish genealogist and DENNISON Patrilineage 1 project member Barry Bradfield:
- (a) one titled "[Dennisons, Chapter 3](#)" that presents much of the evidence Barry has gathered regarding Sir John de Danzielstoun and his sons; Sir John3 represented the 3rd generation of this prominent Scottish baronial family, which has close family connections to the royal Bruce, then Stewart dynasties. Barry thinks that one of Sir John3's sons, Malcolm4, may have been an ancestor of DENNISON Pat 1 project member Patrick Balfour;

(b) "[Denniston and Balfour](#)", a one page piece that consists primarily of an annotated map of Fife highlighting certain areas inhabited by DENNISTONS or BALFOURs; I should note that Inchrye, the family estate of one of the BALFOUR lineages (the one that ended up in Edinburgh that Patrick claims a descent from) is mislocated on this map—it's actually in north Fife in the parish of Abdie, near Lindores.

(7) MAPS of Fife

In addition to [Barry Bradfield's annotated map of Fife](#) showing several locations pertinent to his Theory 1 of DENNISTON->BALFOUR convergence, I've made a couple of simple, unannotated Google maps of the central (vertical) slice of Fife that covers most of the locations of BALFOURs and DENNISTONs mentioned in this report and in the other documents in this bibliography. One map shows [a vertical slice of most of the central portion of Fife from north to south](#) that covers (near the top of the map) the lands of the BALFOURs of Inchrye, Denmylne, and Bargarvie; the other is [a close-up of just the south-central coastal portion of the county](#), covering the stretch of south Fife coastline from the town of Dysart to the town of Leven, where the River Leven, flowing west to east from Loch Leven drains into the Firth of Forth. The River Orr (defining the early BALFOUR Barony of Strath-Or (the valley of the Orr) in a minor tributary of the Leven that has too shadowy a presence to register on most modern maps. The Balbirnie lands that certain BALFOURs acquired about 1600 and just off this south-central Fife map to the west, and the lands of the BALFOURs of Burleigh are another batch of miles further west in the adjacent county of Kinross.

[This online \(interactive\) map of the parishes of Fife](#) also provides a useful framework of reference, although the meaning, and to some extent the names and boundaries of Scottish parishes have changed over the centuries. Originally, the so-called Kingdom of Fife was divided up into feudal estates within, or coterminous with schyres, which were simply divisions of land. The Scottish Reformation in the 16th century created a network of Church of Scotland parishes within each county, and later the same structure (with alterations) was used to create civil parishes for purpose of local governance. Since, however, most of the names and approximate boundaries of these divisions have been carried down through the centuries, this parish structure still provides a convenient means of approximately locating ancient land-holdings such as the estates and baronies granted to the BALFOURs of Fife.

Thus, Gaitmilk (or sometimes Goatmilk) and Kinglassie (a local place name that dates to the 9th century) have all along been alternate names, both for a village, and for the lands that extend to the NE from it, and until 1600 or so, either name denoted a Scottish schyre which included both the lands and the town. As of about 1600, the name Kinglassie was adopted as the name of a co-extensive Church of Scotland parish, and apparently Gaitmilk gradually faded out except, perhaps, as a term of local reference.

Inchrye (near the BALFOUR Denmylne estate), and the BALFOUR Denmylne estate were in Abdie Parish, north central Fife, near the town of Lindores—not on the south coast as Barry's ["Denniston and Balfour" map](#) shows it. [The BALFOUR Bargarvie lands](#) were just to the west of the town of Cupar in the parish of Montimail, which adjoins Abdie parish's eastern border.

APPENDIX A: BALFOURs of Inchrye (north-central Fife) and Pilrig (Edinburgh)

The page# citations {enclosed in curly braces} reference the pages of BOP ([The Balfours of Pilrig](#), (1907).

1-Alexander of Inchrye (say 1468—say 1515), but bef 1518 when his widow and son David were plaintiffs in a suit) {13-14}

was cellarer to James IV from 1499-1512; Inchrye was leased to him in 1502 and the conveyed by release in 1510 Fellow royal employees include John & Patrick of Denmylne, and Michael of Bargarvy—plus a James and a William. Besides his 1502 grant to Alexander of “the tack of Inchrye” near Ladores and Denmylne, the king also granted in 1501 the tack of Denmylne to his cousin John (James of Denmylne)).

m. say 1501 Janet WEYMYSS**2-David (say 1503—1580)** his father’s oldest son and heir; {14}

confirmed as tenant of Inchrye in 1541 on many conditions incl entail and that the grain grown there be milled at Denmylne {p17} crown tenant of Powis, Stirlingshire before 1646; David apparently violated his tenure of Inchrye and settled instead at Powis; By 1567 David2 had apparently alienated Inchrye because he was sued by his son and heir David over the loss of the property; the suit was apparently successful because Queen Mary confirmed Inchrye to David 3 in Apr1567.

m1. by 1526 Katherine ABERCROMBIE, who d. 1558

Though the oldest son and heir is listed first, evidently the remaining children by 1st wife aren’t necessarily in birth order.

3-David (heir)—in 1526 James5 granted him Inchrye in entail w. many conditions;

David abandoned and later sold this estate and had instead become laird of Powis, Stirlingshire (adj to Fife) by 1546; David was later sued by the Queen, who ended up granting Inchrye to David’s son David, on the same conditions; Apparently on his death there were financial difficulties and his heir David never came into Powis. {18}

3-Richard—a minister**3-Harie of Thretty Acres (-1588); sons: Jerome, John, James, Peter****3-James (say 1540 -)**

was a minister, whose first living was at Guthrie (presumably in Angus to the NE of Fife); he was called to Edinburgh St Giles 25Jun1589.

In 1596 Inchrye was bought back into the family by James, prob with the financial help of his second wife, and made over to his eldest bro David in return for £100/year rent, with reversion to James’s youngest son Andrew. Unfortunately, James, as one of the prominent ministers of Edinburgh was caught up in the prolonged controversies with James VI (soon to become James 1 of England) who was determined to replace the Presbyterian church government with English episcopacy. As a result, the aged James Balfour was deprived of his congregation and his living and shuttled around by the king, and was eventually allowed to spend his last years with his dau Nicholas, whose husband was a burgher of Inverkeithing, a south Fife coastal town.

m1. 1575 Barbara MELVILLE

4-James (say 1577 -)—oldest son, and something of a black sheep, though he apparently trained as a minister, and had removed to the Continent

4-Nicholas (dau), who may have been eldest; m. Jul1595 George GARDEN

4-Andrew (abt 1587—1624)

became a minister like his father, graduating at Edinburgh in 1607, and was appointed minister of Kirknewton, in Midlothianshire, Edinburgh’s western suburbs.

Andrew made a testament dative (a kind of will) in which Isobel ARNOT, dau of the deceased John ARNOT of Woodmylne (near Inchrye), was said to have left him her personal property (likely Isobel was his wife); Andrew's testament also names his elder bro James as guardian of his 4 children, but the latter declined because he lived abroad, and the charge was taken up by his married sister Nicholas Garden, who had removed to Edinburg after her husband's death.

m. [?Isobel ARNOT?]

5-James (abt 1619 -)—a lawyer who was admitted to the bar in 1644 {48}

m. Bridget CHALMERS

6-Bridget (1648 -), Helen (1650 -)

6-James (say 1653—abt 1702) {52-54,60-61}

a prosperous merchant and businessman of Edinburgh who inherited lands in Aberdeenshire from his maternal CHALMERS uncle, but was drawn into a ruinous speculative (Darien Company) bubble that was punctured by English political machinations and died insolvent.

m. 1679 Helen SMITH

(children flagged with “*” survived their father, acc to his will) {61}

7-Mary (1680 -)

7-James* (1681—3Feb1737)

James with his mother's encouragement took up his father's debts and businesses and apparently salvaged something from them later the Scottish government recompensed some of the losses on the speculation and James bought the property of Pilrig; settled in Leith and was proprietor of his father's glassworks

m. abt 1704 Louisa Hamilton of Lanarkshire

(children flagged with “#” “died in infancy”)

8-James (1705 -) this James was a philosopher who corresponded with, and eventually replaced David Hume {63-64}

8-Robert (1706 -)

8-William (1708 -#)

8-Helen (1709 -)

8-John (1711 -#) twin

8-George (1711 -) twin

8-Alexander (1713 -)

8-Elizabeth (1714 -)

8-John (1715 -)

8-William (1716 -#)

7-Robert (1682 -)

7-John* (1684 -) This is the John claimed by Patrick as his ancestor, the father of William the weaver, b.1729.

7-Elizabeth (1685 -)

7-Helen* (1688 -)

7-Alexander (1690 -)

7-William (1692 -)

7-Bridget* (1694 -)

7-Elizabeth*(1695 -)

7-Henry* (1698 -)

6-John (1662 -)

6-Robert (1665 -)

6-Christine (1666 -)

5-Andrew

5-John

5-Elizabeth

3-James(continued)

m2. 5Jul1595 Isobel KING, widow of Robert DENNISTOUN, burges tailor of Edinburgh {27, citing Register of Deeds, for Edinburgh} in 1613 Isobel “surrenders an annual rent due to her from two of the Dennistons, probably heirs of her first husband, ‘goldsmith burgesses’ of Edinburgh” {45}

3-Henry—prob a lawyer in Edinburgh

3-John (-1588)—soldier (Capt.) who fought in Flanders etc.; on return went to law w cousin Alexander of Denmylne

3-Alexander

2-David (continued)

m2. Euphame ABERCROMBIE {14}

3-Robert

3-William—became a jeweler in Edinburgh

2-Henry

2-Marion (born say 1515) m. Alexander⁴ Balfour of Denmylne (near Inchrye)) {14; also BH 18}

APPENDIX B: BALFOURS of DENMYLNE {BOP:18-33}

The page# citations {enclosed in curly braces} reference the pages of BH ("[Balfour History](#)") or, where indicated, BOP ([The Balfours of Pilrig](#)), (1907).

1-James Balfour (son of Sir John Balfour of Balgarvy) (say 1420-1460)

was granted, in 1451 or 1452, Denmylne, Abdie Parish, Fife, by King James II (1437-1460). Both died at the battle of Roxburgh.

2-Sir John (say 1455-1513). His tenure of Denmylne was confirmed by James IV and both fell at the Battle of Flodden.

3-Patrick (say 1490—[?]29Sep1541) there is virtually nothing intelligible on this person and the one date given may not be his death date {18}

4-Alexander (say 1520 -) referred to on 2Apr1558 as Alexander of Denmylne; built Denmylne Castle

a lawyer who supposedly partnered with "John Balfour of Pilrig" (John3 of the BOI branch) and who married first, (John3's aunt) Marion2 (Alexander1 of Inchrye), {BH:18}. The "Pilrig" ref is a bit of an anachronism: though Pilrig was a suburb of Edinburgh, Pilrig House wasn't built till much later. {18-19}

m1. Marion2 (Alexander1 Balfour of Inchrye); m2. Janet HAY

[There is almost certainly a missing generation here. JBR]

5-Sir Michael (c1580-1652), knighted 26Mar1630.

household comptroller for Charles I. Michael's line was to daughter out within 100 years of his death. {19-20}

6-Sir James (c1605-14Feb1657/8) 1st baronet of Denmylne & Kinnaird {dates from a testimonial by son Robert, p25}

many pages are devoted to this person {19-25}

7-Sir Robert, 2nd Baronet of Denmylne (1652-1673) {25-27}

6-Alexander of Lumbarne (- 1674/5) as 2nd son inherits later from 7-Robert; 3rd Baronet of Demnylne; minister at Abdie church had 5 sons but only these are noted: {28-29}

7-Sir Michael, 4th Baronet of Denmylne {28}

8-Michael, 5th Baronet of Denmylne, inherited his estate 22Jul1675 "which was in difficulties"; disappeared 1709 {30-32}

9-Sir Michael, 6th Baronet of Demnylne (-1750) {32}

10-Sir Michael, 7th Baronet of Demnylne {32}

10-Sir John, 8th Baronet (-1772) {33}

10-Sir Patrick, 9th Baronet (-1793) at which point the baronetcy became dormant {33}

9-also George, Alexander

8-also John, Alexander, Andrew

7-Sir William—also a minister {29}

6-Sir Michael of Randerston (1623 -) died w/o issue {33-34}

6-Sir David of Forret in the parish of Logie (1623 -) {34-35}

7-Michael, his heir; also James, heir to Randerston; Alexander; Andrew

8-James, 3rd of Forret

6-Sir Andrew of Northbank (1630-1694) an eminent botanist and physician; knighted {35-40}

7-sons Michael, Andrew, David, John, James

APPENDIX C: Census Record Abstracts of Patrick Balfour's Ancestors, 1841-1921

1921 Canadian Census

In York South, Ontario, there's a family headed by John Balfour, tailor (aged 33, b.Ire, parents born in Sco.) who immigrated to Canada in 1912. Also of John's household are wife Mary (29, USA, Eng, Ire), daughter Thresa (6, Can), and Bessie (2, Can).

IRISH Censuses

All of these censuses are lost

SCOTTISH (UK) Censuses

Unfortunately, the Scottish government appears to care more about extracting revenue than ensuring adequate and accurate access to its public records, as it has refused to provide digitized images of its censuses to Ancestry - at least at an affordable price. As a result, the only form in which Ancestry has made it available is in a set of poorly done abstracts that are riddled with obvious transcription errors, and (it appears) incomplete citation information. For what it may be worth, I have copied the matter of these abstracts of Patrick's ancestors for the Scottish censuses from 1841-1881 into my standard UKCensus abstracting format.

As usual, I considered alternative BALFOUR candidates, but the surname isn't particularly common, and there were no real ambiguities of identification.

* 1881 UK(Scottish) Census *

Daniel Balfour household, 3Apr1881 UKCensus, RENF, Greenock, Greenock Middle, no address given
(Greenock Middle, ED36), REG# 564/1, Household Sched 88, Lines 19-21, Roll CSSCT1881_164, no Ancestry image

Rel2

	Aged	Head	Occupation	Born-----
Balfour, Daniel	51	head	ropemaker	RENF Greenock
" , Amelia	52	wife		RENF Greenock
" , John	19	son	joiner	RENF Greenock

John McCulloch household, 3Apr1881 UKCensus, RENF, Greenock, Greenock Middle, 37 Lynedoch st
(Greenock Middle, ED36), REG# 564/1, Household Sched 60, Lines 01-07, Roll CSSCT1881_164, no Ancestry image

Rel2

	Aged	Head	Occupation	Born-----
McColloch, John	35	head	sugarhouse labourer	LANA Glasgow
" , Margt	32	wife		ARGY Dunoon
" , Jane	9	dau	scholar	RENF Greenock
" , James	7	son	scholar	RENF Greenock
" , William	5	son		RENF Greenock
Balfour, Peter	23	ldgr	engine turner at works	RENF Greenock
" , Matilda	22	ldgr		RENF Greenock

* 1871 UK(Scottish) Census *

Duncan Balfour household, 2Apr1871 UKCensus, RENN, Greenock, Greenock West, 58 Lynedoch st
(Greenock West, ED12), REG# 564/3, Household Sched 182, Lines 09-14, Roll CSSCT1871_99, no Ancestry image

Rel2

	Aged	Head	Occupation	Born-----
Balfour, Duncan	41	head	ropemaker	RENF Greenock
" , Amelia	42	wife		RENF Greenock
" , William	18	son	railway clerk	RENF Greenock
" , Peter	15	son	scholar	RENF Greenock
" , John	9	son	scholar	RENF Greenock

It's hard to see how Daniel could have been misread as Duncan. Peter's age was probably also misread.

* 1861 UK(Scottish) Census *

Damel Balfour household, 1861 ScottishCensus, RENN, Greenock, Greenock West, 58 Vennel
(Greenock West, ED25), REG# 564/3, Household Sched 80, Lines 16-20, Roll CSSCT1861_77, no Ancestry image.

Rel2

	Aged	Head	Occupation	Born-----
Balfour, Damel [sic]	31	head	roperjrinner[rope spinner]	RENF Greenock
" , Amdres [sic]	32	wife		RENF Greenock
" , William	8	son	scholar	RENF Greenock
" , Peter	2	son		RENF Greenock
" , Amelia	1	dau		RENF Greenock

The first two given names were obviously misread. Amazingly stupid that however bad the writing, "Damel" (a given name I've never seen) was substituted for Daniel, one of the most common names in this parts; also that the Amelia of the daughter wasn't recognized as also the name of the wife.

* 1851 UK(Scottish) Census *

Willm Balfour household, 1851 ScottishCensus, RENN, Greenock, Greenock West, 59 Ann St 59
(Greenock West, ED106, p9), Parish# 564, Lines 12-14, Roll CSSCT1851_120, no Ancestry image.

Rel2

	Aged	Head	Occupation	Born-----
Balfour, Willm	57	head	coal dealer	[RENF] Greenock
" , Janet	26	dau	dress maker	[RENF] Greenock
" , Daniel	21	son	rope spinner	[RENF] Greenock

Will[ia]m's age was probably 59, but misread.

* 1841 UK (Scottish) Census *

William Balfour household, 1841 Scottish Census, RENF, Greenock, Greenock West, Ann St
(Greenock West), Parish# 564, no Ancestry image.

	Aged	Occupation	Born-----
Balfour, William	40	coal agent	RENF Greenock
" , Catherine	35		RENF Greenock
" , Janet	15		RENF Greenock
" , Daniel	12		RENF Greenock